

Independence - The debate

Posted by Ernhw Ltd - 11 Dec 2012 17:37

What is your view?

=====

Re: Independence - The debate

Posted by Ernhw Ltd - 11 Dec 2012 18:05

Re: Independence - The debate

Posted by Ernhw Ltd - 11 Dec 2012 18:06

Re: Independence - The debate

Posted by lasercow - 11 Dec 2012 18:33

I think we are safe discussing this - it is not a political topic, as a vote for independence is not a vote for the SNP.

I think Jose Manuel Barroso's statement that an independent Scotland would have to apply to join the EU is a big blow to the Yes camp. All along they have been saying, without foundation it appears, that we would just sort of carry on in Europe with minor changes. Now, if Mr Barroso is right, then Scotland would have to join as any other non-EU country. This would require a renegotiation of all the deals we have with the EU at the moment. It would require unanimous acceptance from all other EU countries. At least 3 of them (Spain, Poland, Italy) have regions which may wish to separate - they will not be minded to see Scotland join easily with a great deal.

The SNP are claiming Scotland will be one of the richest countries in the world - our contributions would therefore reflect this (and forget the UK rebate...).

I have no doubt that Scotland would gain membership - but it would not be quick and it would definitely

not be on our terms. Norway has access to the Common Market - but it's citizens pay the most in Europe for the privilege, and have no say at all in EU regulations, despite having to implement them. Switzerland has a very cushy deal with the EU, but many are unhappy with this - we would not get such a good deal.

The main point about this latest revelation, is that no negotiations would take place before a Yes vote. As with negotiations with the UK, we are expected to vote on an issues that we do not know...and can't unless we vote yes!

I can't imagine that this statement was made off the cuff - this must have come from the top EU legal experts. John and Nicola may still say that it is wrong, but I can't see how Barroso would say this unless he was fairly sure he was correct. Even if John and Nicola are correct, they would probably need a lengthy legal battle against the EU...just what you want before you start negotiations to join!

=====

Re: Independence - The debate

Posted by lasercow - 11 Dec 2012 18:40

I can't see how we could keep the pound either - it would set a precedent for any other small country joining the EU in the future that they couldn't allow, if they want the fiscal union to survive.

=====

Re: Independence - The debate

Posted by Gordon McCaskill - 12 Dec 2012 08:08

I think the basic problem is one of misunderstanding. For quite a while, mainly due to the Press, people have talked about EU citizenship, there is no such thing as EU citizenship, there is EU membership voluntarily, but not EU citizenship (citizenship is involuntary you're born into it).

The second misunderstanding is regarding three entities which are treated as the same but are, in fact, completely different - country, nation and state. Scotland is a country, that is to say that there is a geographic landmass which is recognized both internally and externally as Scotland. Scotland is also a nation, that is to say that certain institutions exist which are uniquely Scottish in the country known as Scotland. Scotland, however, is not a state. So what's a state.

The definition of a state as recognised throughout the world, except curiously in the United States is this - a state is a self-perpetuating entity which is the sole repository of power and prerogative of rule within its own sovereign territory and it maintains that power by the exclusive exercise of legitimate violence. In other words, a state is all of a government's institutions which include military force. Clearly Scotland

does not fall into that category.

Now consider Mr. Barroso's words. Scotland would be a new state and would have to re-apply. In short, the Referendum is not about creating a new country or a new nation, but a new state.

=====